Detailed Contents

Teaching the Craft of Argument  xxvii
Acknowledgments  xxxv

PART I: THE NATURE OF ARGUMENT  1

Chapter 1: Argument and Rationality  3
  What Is Argument?  3
  What Good Is Argument?  4
  Argument Makes Us Rational  4
  Arguments Sustain Communities  6
  Arguments Define Academic and Professional Communities  7
  Arguments Enable Democracy  7
  What’s Not an Argument?  8
  Explanations  8
  Three Forms of Persuasion That Are Not Arguments  9
  Stories  10
When Arguments Go Bad  11
Writing Process: Argument and Rationality  12
  Thinking-Reading-Talking  13
  Preparing and Planning  14
  Drafting  16
  Revising  17
  Working Collaboratively  18
Inquiries  19
Focus on Writing  20
In a Nutshell  23
Going Online  24

Chapter 2: Argument as Civil Conversation  25
  The Questions of Argument  25
  Argument’s Roots in Civil Conversation  26
  Two Friendly Questions About What Sue Thinks  28
  Two Challenging Questions About the Basis of Sue’s Argument  28
  The Most Challenging Question: But What About? . . .  30
Detailed Contents

Review: Modeling an Argument 32
The Core of an Argument: Claim + Support 32
Anchoring the Core: Evidence and Warrants 33
The Fifth Question: Acknowledgments and Responses 35
Crafting Written Arguments 36
Thickening Your Argument 38
Writing Process: Argument as Civil Conversation 39
Preparing and Planning 39
Drafting 44
Revising 45
Working Collaboratively 46
Inquiries 48
Focus on Writing 49
Sample Essays 52
In a Nutshell 55
Going Online 57

Chapter 3: Motivating Your Argument 58
Two Kinds of Problems 58
Pragmatic Problems 59
Conceptual Problems 59
The Structure of Problems 60
Pragmatic Problems 60
Conceptual Problems 62
Framing Problems in Introductions 64
The Core of Your Introduction: Destabilizing Conditions and Costs 64
The Outer Frame of Your Introduction: Common Ground and Solution 68
Problem-Posing Versus Problem-Solving Arguments 75
Conclusions 76
Introductions and Conclusions as Ways of Thinking 77
Writing Process: Motivating Your Argument 77
Thinking-Reading-Talking 77
Preparing and Planning 78
Drafting 81
Revising 81
Working Collaboratively 83
Inquiries 83
Focus on Writing 84
Sample Essays 86
In a Nutshell 87
Going Online 89
PART 2: DEVELOPING YOUR ARGUMENT

Chapter 4: Articulating Claims

Exploring Claims without Rushing to Judgment
What Kind of Claim Does Your Problem Require?
Is Your Claim Pragmatic or Conceptual?
What Degree of Acceptance Do You Seek for Your Claim?
What Counts as a Claim Worth Considering?
Can Your Claim Be Contested?
Can Your Claim Be Proved Wrong?
Is Your Claim Reasonable on Its Face?
What Counts as a Thoughtful Claim?
Is Your Claim Conceptually Rich?
Is Your Claim Logically Rich?
Is Your Claim Appropriately Qualified?
Writing Process: Finding and Articulating Claims
Preparing and Planning
Drafting
Revising
Inquiries
Focus on Writing
In a Nutshell
Going Online

Chapter 5: Reasons and Evidence

Reasons and Evidence as Forms of Support
Distinguishing Reasons and Evidence
Distinguishing Evidence and Reports of It
Primary and Reported Evidence
Multiple Reasons
Reasons in Parallel
Reasons in Sequence
The Deep Complexity of Serious Arguments
Using Reasons to Help Readers Understand Evidence
Writing Process: Reasons and Evidence
Preparing and Planning
Revising
Inquiries
Focus on Writing
Sample Essay
## Detailed Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In a Nutshell</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Going Online</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 6: Reporting Evidence</strong></td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weigh Your Burden of Evidence</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Four Maxims of Quality</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustworthy Reports of Evidence</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of Memories</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anecdotes</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports from Authorities</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photographs, Films, and Videotapes</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantitative Data</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negotiating What Counts as Evidence</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radical Skepticism</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Writing Process: Evidence</strong></td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinking-Reading-Talking</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparing and Planning</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drafting</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working Collaboratively</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inquiries</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on Writing</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample Essay</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In a Nutshell</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Going Online</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 7: W warranting Claims and Reasons</strong></td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How Warrants Connect Reasons and Claims</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What Warrants Look Like</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distinguishing Reasons and Warrants</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Challenge of Using Warrants</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Can Readers Think of Your Warrant on Their Own?</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Is Your Warrant True?</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Does Your Warrant Actually Apply to the Reason and Claim?</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Is Your Warrant Appropriate to Your Readers’ Community?</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review: A Test Case</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W warranting Evidence as Relevant</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arguing by Evidence Versus Arguing by Warrants</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Writing Process: W warrants</strong></td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparing and Planning</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Detailed Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Working Collaboratively</th>
<th>173</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inquiries</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on Writing</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In a Nutshell</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Going Online</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Chapter 8: Acknowledgments and Responses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Importance of Other Viewpoints</th>
<th>179</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Questioning Your Problem and Its Solution</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questioning Your Support</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questioning Your Consistency</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responses as Subordinate Arguments</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Process: Acknowledgments and Responses</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Thinking-Reading-Talking          | 185 |
| Preparing and Planning            | 186 |
| Drafting                          | 187 |
| Working Collaboratively           | 190 |
| Inquiries                         | 191 |
| Focus on Writing                  | 192 |
| Sample Essay                      | 193 |
| In a Nutshell                     | 197 |
| Going Online                      | 198 |

#### PART 3: THINKING ABOUT THINKING IN ARGUMENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 9: The Forms of Reasoning</th>
<th>199</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Three Forms of Reasoning</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inductive Reasoning: From Specifics to a General Conclusion</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deductive Reasoning: From a Generalization to a Specific Conclusion</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abductive Reasoning: From Problem to Hypothesis to Confirmation</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real-Life Barriers to Thinking Clearly</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bias in Abductive Thinking</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bias in Inductive Thinking</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bias in Deductive Thinking</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Process: The Forms of Reasoning</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparing and Planning</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In a Nutshell</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Going Online</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 10: Arguments About Meanings

Some Terminology

Meanings and Problems
What Problem Does Your Definition Solve?
Is the Issue of Meaning a Surrogate for a Larger Problem?

How to Argue About Meanings
Do Readers Expect Common or Authorized Meanings?
Strategies for Using Common Meanings
Strategies for Using Authorized Meanings
When to Rely on Authorized Definitions
Why Dictionaries Cannot Settle Arguments Over Meaning

Writing Process: Arguments About Meanings
Preparing and Planning
Drafting
Inquiries
In a Nutshell
Going Online

Chapter 11: Arguments About Causes

The Impossible Vastness of Causes
Finding Relevant Causes
Everyday Thinking About Causation
Thoughtful Thinking About Causation

Analyzing Causation Systematically
The Principle of Similarity and Difference
The Principle of Covariation
ANOVA as Exploration
Four Cautions About Using the Principles

Causation and Personal Responsibility
Who’s Responsible?
Five Criteria for Assigning Personal Responsibility
Attribution Bias

Writing Process: Arguments About Causes
Preparing and Planning
Drafting
Inquiries
In a Nutshell
Going Online
## PART 4: THE LANGUAGES OF ARGUMENT

### Chapter 12: Clear Language

- **Some Principles of Clear and Direct Writing**
- **Concision and Vividness**
- How to Be Concise
- How to Be Vivid
- Abstract Versus Concrete
- The System of Imageable Words
- Deliberate Generality

**Writing Process: Clear Language**
- Thinking-Reading-Talking
- Revising

**A Guide to Terms: Clear Language**

**In a Nutshell**

**Going Online**

### Chapter 13: The Overt and Covert Force of Language

- **Invoking Values, Evoking Feeling**
- Value-Laden Words
- You Can’t Avoid Values

**When Emotional Language Undermines Sound Thinking**
- Polarizing Language
- Cynical Language

**Subjects and Point of View**
- Manipulating Subjects to Assign Responsibility
- Making Qualities Characters
- Treating Means as Agents

**Abstractions as Characters**

**Metaphorical Scenarios**

**Writing Process: The Overt and Covert Force of Language**
- Drafting
- Revising

**Inquiries**

**In a Nutshell**

**Going Online**

### CHECKLISTS FOR PLANNING AND REVISING
A Checklist for Evaluating Discussion/ Paper Questions  302
A Checklist for Argument  302
Ten Steps to a Coherent Paper  303
A Complete List of Questions  305
Storyboarding a Long Paper  310
APPENDIX 1: Fallacies  314
APPENDIX 2: A Quick Guide to Citations  321

PART 5: READINGS  329

Section 1 Truthfulness and Deception  331
Introduction  331
Pre-writing and Pre-reading Activities  332
On a Supposed Right to Lie from Altruistic Motives  333
Immanuel Kant
This excerpt, from Kant’s Critique of Practical Reason and Other Writings in Moral Philosophy, offers perhaps the most uncompromising view that lying is always wrong, no exceptions.

From Lying: Moral Choice in Public and Private Life  334
Sissela Bok
Philosopher Sissela Bok raises questions and poses problems about lies so successfully that she is cited frequently by later writers with different views. The portions excerpted here are from her Introduction.

Lies, Damn Lies, and Statistics  342
Jonathan Rauch
Rauch explores the “misty jungle” between “outright lying” and “political spin,” drawing comparisons between Bill Clinton’s lies about sex and other, potentially more harmful, deceptions.

The Truth About Lying  344
Allison Kornet
In this popular presentation of scholarly research on deception, Kornet focuses on the frequency of lying and questions whether we really want to eliminate lies from our daily lives.

Sociobiology of Deceit  348
Charles V. Ford
In this conclusion to his book Lies! Lies!! Lies!!! The Psychology of Deceit, Ford offers a summative definition he terms the “sociobiology of deceit.” From his scientific perspective, deceit may be understood as a highly evolved form of adaptive behavior rather than a moral failing that must be overcome.

Are We Lying to Ourselves About Deception?  349
Jill Doner Kagle
Kagle draws on research about lying from a variety of disciplines in order to define and assess the problem of deception for the profession of social work. She suggests that her conclusions are
relevant for other professions as well, because deception and self-deception are common practice rather than signs of personal and interpersonal difficulties.

CASE 1: Private Lives, Public Lies 365
Overview 365

Preface to Rigoberta Menchú and the Story of All Poor Guatemalans 368
David Stoll
Stoll’s introduction lays out his two key aims in writing the book: (1) Were the indigenous Mayans part of the guerilla movement in Guatemala or were they a third group, caught between the guerillas and the government? (2) Why did Menchú’s story become such an immediate force among intellectuals and left-of-center historians? The problem is that he does not make his purposes clear until the middle of his Preface. Instead, he opens the second paragraph of his Preface, well before he raises any other issue, with a question that focuses us on Menchú: “What if much of Rigoberta’s story is not true?” That frames our understanding of his entire book in terms of Menchú’s truth, rather than in terms of the larger issues he opens up later in his Preface.

The Unmaking of Rigoberta Menchú 371
Hal Cohen
Cohen’s article appeared in Lingua Franca, a journal aimed at professors in the Humanities and the Social Sciences. It was [it has suspended publication] more a popular journal than a scholarly one, and it takes on controversial topics, so its writers are expected to stir things up rather than settle things down. It took a distinctly skeptical stance toward political correctness and the intellectual fads of Post Modernism and Post Colonialism. While it was not a right-wing journal, its targets were frequently left-of-center.

I, Rigoberta Menchú, Liar 377
David Horowitz
Horowitz represents the extreme of the right-wing attack on Menchú, and he uses Stoll’s exposure of Menchú’s fabrications as occasion to attack not only her book, but the political positions he sees as aligned with her.

Nothing but Innuendo and Weak Allegations 381
Robin Blackburn
Blackburn is an editor at Verso, the press that published Rigoberta Menchú’s I, Rigoberta. Verso specializes in left-of-center political and critical books aimed at both the popular and the academic market.

Professor’s Past in Doubt 382
Walter V. Robinson
Robinson is a staff writer for the Boston Globe, one of this country’s leading newspapers. Its readership is probably mostly center or left-of-center, if the political tendencies of Boston and Massachusetts are any indication (it is a strongly Democratic city in a generally Democratic state).

Truth and Consequences 386
Jack Beatty
Beatty is an editorial writer for Atlantic, a monthly magazine addressed to an educated audience. Atlantic’s readers are mostly middle-of-the-road.
Ann Coulter is a syndicated columnist and a conservative zealot, writing for a staunchly right-wing journal and readership.

CASE 2: Santa Claus

Yes, Virginia, There Is a Santa

Francis Pharcellus Church

Journalist Church's response to a child who wrote to ask him whether Santa was real was first published in 1897. It is reprinted every Christmas, and for many people stands as the perfect justification for perpetuating the myth of Santa Claus.

Yes, Virginia, There Probably Is No Santa Claus

Champe Ransom

Ransom's skeptical analysis of Church's argument takes Church to task for evasion and faulty logic, and challenges the ethics of his willful deception of a child.

The Humanist is a publication of the American Humanist Association, and represents critical thinking on a variety of contemporary issues.

Santa Claus

Cindy Dell Clark

Clark's book studies childhood myths including the tooth fairy, the Easter Bunny, and Santa Claus. She argues that children are not merely dupes at Christmas time, but that they help shape the Santa story. She also concludes that the Santa myth supports rather than diminishes children's capacity for faith, and so has a beneficent effect on children.

Cultural Myths and Rituals

Marjorie Taylor

Psychologist Taylor counters the common contention that children's belief in Santa demonstrates their inability to distinguish between reality and fantasy. She notes that adults go to great lengths to provide children with empirical evidence of Santa's existence, and so children conclude that Santa is real using rational rather than irrational capacities.

Knowledge: The Case of Santa Claus

Frances Chaput Waksler

Using Bok's definition of lying, sociologist Waksler argues that children's belief in Santa Claus is based on what they are taught to believe is wrong—lies and deception—and therefore is a source of some of the "little trials of childhood." She refutes Clark's argument that Santa is a myth created and supported by children rather than by adults. She concludes that one unfortunate lesson of the Santa deception is that "to lie and deceive is thus to become an adult."

A MODEL ANALYSIS OF FORMAL ARGUMENT

Jill Doner Kagle's "Are We Lying to Ourselves About Deception?"

Section 2: Collective Delusion: Irrational Fears, Panicked Responses

Introduction
Defining Hysteria

Elaine Showalter

Showalter’s definition of hysteria is drawn from the second chapter of her scholarly book
Hystories: Hysterical Epidemics and Modern Culture (1997). Showalter stresses the communal
nature of mass hysteria, emphasizing how fear builds in groups and why authorities’ reactions
have a crucial impact on whether hysteria swells or subsides.

Moral Panics

Erich Goode and Nachman Ben-Yehuda

Goode and Ben-Yehuda’s book on moral panics was published by Oxford, a university press that
targets both academic readers and a wider, but still well-informed audience. Goode and Ben-
Yehuda offer a five-part paradigm we can use to assess potential moral panics: concern, hostility,
consensus, disproportionality, and volatility. All of these elements are necessary, they argue, for
any given episode to qualify as a moral panic, and using these elements as criteria enables us to
make informed judgments about specific issues and episodes.

Mass Delusions and Hysterias: Highlights from the Past Millennium

Robert E. Bartholomew and Erich Goode

The Skeptical Inquirer is published by the Committee for the Scientific Investigation of Claims
of the Paranormal, and is devoted to subjecting claims about extraordinary phenomena to
rational scrutiny. Bartholomew and Goode report on selected examples of mass delusions from
the middle ages through the 1990s, several of which are excerpted here in order to illustrate
the wide range of forms that collective delusion
can take.

CASE 1: The Salem Witch Trials

Overview

Under an Evil Hand

Larry Gragg

Historian Larry Gragg wrote this narrative of the events at Salem based on research for his
book entitled The Salem Witch Crisis. American History Illustrated publishes work by
historians directed at a wider audience. The information in this article will provide you with
background you can use in understanding the arguments in the following articles. An additional
historical note: on November 2, 2001, the Massachusetts legislature approved a resolution
clearing the records of the seven victims whose convictions had remained on record.

Excerpts from The Crucible

Arthur Miller

Arthur Miller is one of many writers who have used the Salem Witch Trials as material for
creative literature. The print version of his play The Crucible (first produced in 1953) contains
several inserted passages in which Miller argues that the witch trials are best understood as a
political conflict fueled by personal antagonisms. He stresses the parallel between the events in
Salem and the tracking and persecution of suspected communists in the United States in the
1950s.

Ergotism: The Satan Loosed in Salem?

Linnda R. Caporael

Linnda R. Caporael’s article, published in a journal that presents scholarly work for a more
general audience, draws on a range of historical and scientific evidence to forward an argument
that the witch trials may have been sparked by a genuine physical malady: ergot poisoning. While several authors have persuasively disputed her conclusions, her contention that some Salem residents may have been genuinely sick offers an intriguing counterpoint to those who would assume that all the symptoms described in court records were fabricated or delusory.

Witchcraft or Mycotoxin? The Salem Witch Trials

Alan Woolf

Alan Woolf's refutation of the ergotism case was published more than twenty years after Caporael's article appeared in Science, suggesting how appealing the ergot explanation continues to be. Woolf takes the ergot case apart in order to dismiss the pieces of evidence one by one.

America: The Devil in Salem

Hans Sebald

In his study of “witch children,” sociologist Hans Sebald argues that adults make a fatal error when they accept children's accusations as truthful, because the psychology of children makes them suggestible, and likely to act out of fantasy and malice with total disregard for the lives they may destroy. In these excerpts, Sebald offers his version of the events in Salem, presenting a narrative in which the children are the central actors and persecutors, very much aware of playing roles on a stage, and of conniving together and manipulating the adults. Their behavior illustrates psychological aberrations that he defines as “mythomania” and “demonopathy.”

Masks of Mythomania and Demonopathy

Hans Sebald

Sebald offers his version of the events in Salem, presenting a narrative in which the children are the central actors and persecutors very much aware of playing roles on a stage, and of conniving together and manipulating the adults. Their behavior illustrates psychological aberrations that he defines as “mythomania” and demonopathy.”

Children, Witches, Demons, and Cultural Reality

Phillips Stevens, Jr.

In a review of Sebald's book published in Free Inquiry, anthropologist Phillips Stevens, Jr. takes issue with Sebald’s assumption that any rational person would share an attitude of “incredulous disbelief” toward the claims made by those who claimed to suffer from witchcraft. Stevens considers the possibility that the accusations of the afflicted children may have been based on actual experiences. Stevens argues that the Salem children were experiencing a genuine altered state of consciousness rather than playacting.

CASE 2: Collective Delusion: Contemporary Arguments

Overview

We Are Facing a Deadly Enemy Not Anthrax, but Hysteria

Steve Connor

Writing in a London newspaper while the United States was in the midst of dealing with several deaths caused by anthrax in the mail, Connor argues that people around the world are exaggerating the threat posed by anthrax, and are thus in danger of succumbing to mass hysteria.

India's Monkey Man and the Politics of Mass Hysteria

Prasenjit Maiti

Maiti reflects on a recent case of mass hysteria that afflicted a large number of people in New Delhi, India, noting the means by which “rational and responsible individuals” were at length able to halt it.
Salem Revisited
Robert H. Nelson
Robert H. Nelson's editorial for Forbes magazine likens environmental activists to witch hunters, and chemicals expected of causing cancer to the innocent victims.

Is This a Drug War or a Witch-Hunt?
Arianna Huffington
Arianna Huffington's newspaper editorial argues that "drug-war hysteria" combined with racism to fuel a witch hunt in Tulia, Texas, that was only stopped by the intervention of one man who recognized that injustice was being perpetrated.

The Dot-Com Witch-Hunt
Rana Foroohar and Stefan Theil
Foroohar and Theil contend that "shareholder activists" who were burned by the crash of dot.com companies are undertaking a witch hunt in their drive to find someone to blame for their personal financial disasters.

Abusive Justice
Rael Jean Isaac
Rael Jean Isaac's article compares the prosecution of certain child abuse defendants with the excesses of the Salem Witch Trials, arguing that Janet Reno, then a district attorney in Florida, is responsible for the convictions of innocent people. Of the two defendants whose stories are featured here, one has since been released from prison (Grant Snowden) while the other, Frank Fuster, is still incarcerated.

A MODEL ANALYSIS OF INFORMAL ARGUMENT
Steve Connor's "We Are Facing a Deadly Enemy Not Anthrax, but Hysteria"

Section 3 Romantic Love
Introduction
The Future of Love
Barbara Graham
The Utne Reader reprints articles from a wide range of alternative publications, and on a wide range of subjects. In this feature article, written for Utne, Graham offers an overview of research on love, concluding with the argument that contemporary couples need to move past child-like fantasies of romantic love to incorporate a concept of transcendence or spiritual wholeness into partnership.

Making Up Emotional People
Cheshire Calhoun
This article is a chapter in a collection of work by legal scholars. Calhoun begins with this destabilizing condition: "What is puzzling about definitional arguments against same-sex marriage is that they look so weak. Where is the depth of the conviction that definitional arguments are good reasons coming from?" She then argues that our society, as a whole, finds same-sex marriage inconceivable for several reasons, the most prominent being that homosexuality has been viewed as inherently incompatible with romantic love. She claims that the legal bans against same-sex marriage rest largely on ideas about romantic love that reinforce the social hierarchy, and that they survive because cultural images of romance remain almost exclusively heterosexual and because research on love almost always focuses on heterosexual couples.
xx Detailed Contents

College Student Attitudes Toward Sexual Intimacy
David Knox, LaKisha Sturdivant, and Marty E. Zusman
The College Student Journal is a refereed periodical that publishes research related specifically to college students. This article reports the results of a survey of college undergraduates, and connects these results to related research. The authors conclude that their data support "the adage that women see sex as an expression of love and men see sex as sex."

CASE 1: Romance Online
Overview
Love Online
Adam Rogers and Kevin Platt
In this article from the "Science & Technology" section of Newsweek, the authors attempt to answer "the big question—the one that everyone wants answered— ... whether meeting your eventual spouse on the Net is more likely than in the real world." They do not argue for a definitive answer, but the anecdotes and research they review suggest that many people rely heavily on the Internet as a means to romance, and that we are developing ever smarter ways of using the technology in pursuit of intimacy.

Love on the Internet
B. Cornwell and D. C. Lundgren
This scholarly article illustrates the sort of complex research now being conducted on problems concerning human relationships mediated through technology. We have excerpted the introduction, discussion and conclusion, so that you have the shape of the argument though not the detailed methods, results, and statistical analyses included in the full article.

Downloading Love
Katherine Milewski, Mark Nicholas Hatala, and Daniel W. Baack
These authors focus specifically on the behaviors of college students who initiate relationships through personal advertisements. They studied 100 personal advertisements posted on the Web and conclude that students reveal less personal information online that in comparable print ads, that online ads only rarely indicate that the student is interested in long-term commitment, and that students tend to post on-line personals at the beginning or at the end of their college careers.

Spying at Home: A New Pastime to Detect Online Romance
Bill Hancock
Hancock discusses the use and potential abuse of inexpensive software that can be used to spy on people suspected of carrying on flirtations in cyberspace. He raises more questions than he answers, suggesting a number of directions for research about online romance could take: for example, is it infidelity if the sex is only "virtual"? Is it ethical to spy on a partner using this software? How likely is it that an online flirtation will become a physical affair?

CASE 2: Love in the Movies
Overview
Love and Laughter: A Cinematic Valentine’s Day Bouquet
Wes Gehring
College professor Gehring offers simple definitions of screwball and romantic comedies for a popular audience, noting four areas of difference between them, and listing many examples that instructors and students could draw from for films to view.
The Same, but Different
Kathrina Glitre
Glitre’s scholarly article, written for a journal of film studies, argues that screwball comedies challenge conventional marriage because the couples subvert traditional romantic ideals and the happy endings are often unstable.

The End of Romance: The Demystification of Love in the Postmodern Age
James J. Dowd and Nicole R. Pallotta
An in-depth sociological study of how contemporary romantic comedies compare to great romantic dramas of past Hollywood. The authors argue that postmodern attitudes of disillusion and cynicism combined with the success of civil rights and feminist movements have created a culture in which romantic comedies must use trivial barriers to keep lovers apart because significant barriers no longer exist. Viewers consume romantic comedy after romantic comedy, suggesting there is an unsatisfied longing for a romantic utopia we don’t supposedly believe in anymore.

Kiss Kiss, Sob Sob
Karen Schoemer
Schoemer’s article for popular magazine Newsweek combines an entertaining personal narrative with an argument. She begins by challenging the assumption that tear-jerker films are “chick movies,” but modifies that challenge in several ways as the article progresses.

The Subversive Potential of the Unlikely Couple Film
Thomas E. Wartenberg
The introduction to Wartenberg’s book argues that Hollywood films have frequently portrayed “unlikely couples” that cross traditional barriers of race, class, and sexual orientation in such a way as to challenge social norms governing who is allowed to experience romantic love and who is not.

A MODEL ANALYSIS OF FORMAL ARGUMENT
David Knox, LaKisha Sturdivant, and Marty E. Zusman’s “College Student Attitudes Toward Sexual Intimacy”

College Student Attitudes Toward Sexual Intimacy
David Knox, LaKisha Sturdivant, and Marty E. Zusman

Section 4: Life on the Edge: Our Love/Hate Relationship with Risk
Introduction
Calculated Risks: What Are the Chances?
K. C. Cole
Establishes the distinction between risk and danger.

A Busted Flush: How America’s Love Affair with Gambling Turned to Disillusionment
The Economist
Argues that although the gaming industry seems healthy, its very popularity will lead to diminishing returns for gaming outlets and the communities that host them.

Risk
Paul Roberts
Explores the line between constructive and sociopathic risk taking.
CASE 1: Getting There in One Piece

Overview

Taming the Road Warrior
Janet B. Goehring
The author tracks legislative efforts to curb aggressive driving.

Arms Race on the Highway
Paul Rauber
“The most dangerous part of almost any outdoor activity is driving there in your car. Car crashes are the leading cause of accidental death in the United States…”

Graduated Licensure: A Win-Win Proposition for Teen Drivers and Parents
Mark L. Rosenberg and Ricardo Martinez
“To reduce deaths and injuries from vehicle accidents, the American Academy of Pediatrics recommends that teenage drivers be given restricted licenses.”

How Safe Can We Get?
Daniel Eisenberg, Cathy Booth Thomas, et al.
“Put up against ‘Swiss-cheese’ operations such as those in the countries once part of the Soviet Union or Thailand, where corruption at the airport is endemic, the U. S. is a model of tightness. But compared with the top airports in Europe and Asia, the U. S. continues to lag.”

CASE 2: Binge Drinking and Student Health

Overview

Health and Behavioral Consequences of Binge Drinking in College: A National Survey of Students at 140 Campuses
Henry Wechsler, Andrea Davenport, George Dowdall, Barbara Moeykens, and Sonia Castillo
“Students who did not binge and who reside at schools with high levels of binge drinkers were up to three times as likely to report being bothered by the drinking-related behaviors of other students than students who did not binge and who reside at schools with lower levels of binge drinkers. These problems included being pushed, hit, or assaulted and experiencing an unwanted sexual advance.”

Purging Bingeing
Ed Carson
“Two fifths of college students are binge drinkers and harm themselves as well as others as a result. This is not perceived as drinking problem, but a drinking behavior problem. Solution lies in teaching them drinking behavior—at home.”

Binge Drinking as a Substitute for a “Community of Learning”
Kenneth Bruffee
“We need to know whether collaborative learning can reduce the social desperation that drives students to binge drinking.”

Wisdom in a Bottle
Camille Paglia
“The authoritarian Big Mommy and Daddy who run the summer camps we call colleges can’t decide what a student is these days: A thinking, breathing, exploring, risk-taking adult? Or a cash cow haltered and hidebound by the thick parental checkbook?”
A MODEL ANALYSIS OF FORMAL ARGUMENT
Paul Roberts’s “Risk” 609

Section 5: A New You: Beauty, Identity, and Consumerism 614
Introduction 614
Isn’t She Lovely? 615
Brad Lemley
Beauty may not be in the eye of the beholder; recent research in beauty studies suggests some biologically grounded preferences that cut across race, ethnicity, and culture.

Nothing Becomes a Man More Than a Woman’s Face 619
Natalie Angier
“The more we learn about beauty, the more we realize that the ‘meaning of beauty’ is still up for grabs.”

Frat-Boy Fetishism: When the Goods Get Together 622
Freya Johnson
Prompted by a car commercial, the author muses on fraternity members’ simultaneous roles as überconsumers and commodities.

CASE 1: Body Image/Body Art 627
Overview 627
Ring Leader 628
Natalie Kusz
Overweight and facially scarred, the author felt alienated from her body even into adulthood. She reflects on how a nose ring helped her claim ownership over her self-image.

Beauty or the Beast? 630
Susan Lundine
“Tattoos and piercings have come to be accepted socially as fashion trends especially among the urban youth who are subjected to peer pressure when attempting to become socially accepted. This trend leads to clashes with parents who see tattoos as forms of body mutilation. To teenagers, however, tattoos signify the transformation into a personalized body or the memento of an ongoing relationship. Tattoos also signify a quest for permanence or a sense of allegiance to larger groups.”

On Teenagers and Tattoos 632
Andres Martin
Research finds unattractive people are shortchanged in hiring and pay.

Santa Cruz Grants Anti-Bias Protection to the Ugly 635
Richard C. Paddock
Paddock surveys the arguments swirling around an ordinance that seeks to prevent workplace discrimination based on physical appearance.

Looks Won’t Mean a Lot if Anti-Bias Law Is Approved 637
Martha Groves
A second look at the Santa Cruz ordinance.
Santa Cruz’ weirdocracy 638
Washington Times
From the East coast, a dismissive look at the Santa Cruz ordinance.

CASE 2: School Uniforms 641
Overview 641
Uniforms Rule 642
Pat Wingert
While uniforms may not improve students’ behavior or academic success, they affect student attitudes and help to foster a sense of connectedness between students.

School Uniforms: The Answer to Violence in American Schools or a Cheap Educational Reform? 643
Julia Wilkins
Wilkins is unconvinced that school uniforms are a reasonable answer to violence in U.S. public schools.

Study Suggests School Uniforms Have Not Had the Impact Proponents Hoped For 647
Sabrina Walters
The author reviews the mixed early results of mandatory uniform policy in Florida’s Dade County.

Should School Uniforms Be Mandated in Elementary Schools? 649
Keith A. King
The author reviews the inconclusive data on school uniforms and makes seven recommendations for further study.

A MODEL ANALYSIS OF INFORMAL ARGUMENT 654
Julia Wilkins’s “School Uniforms: The Answer to Violence in American Schools or a Cheap Educational Reform?”

Section 6: A Full House: American Family Values 659
Introduction 659
The Simpsons: Atomistic Politics and the Nuclear Family 660
Paul A. Cantor
Cantor argues that the Simpsons might offer one of the most interesting and “important images of the family in contemporary American culture.”

She Loves Me, She Loves Me Not 663
Susan Caba
Hrdy’s case is that maternal instinct is far more complicated than we usually think.

Defining Daddy Down 665
Barbara Dafoe Whitehead and David Popenoe
Is too much attention being paid to divorced and unwed fathers while married fathers who live with their children are neglected?
### Detailed Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>CASE 1: Childcare</strong></td>
<td>668</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>668</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Mommy Wars</strong></td>
<td>669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cathy Young</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young suggests that “the habit of treating work and motherhood as an either/or proposition” blinds us to the realities of working families.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>More Work, More Play</strong></td>
<td>671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deborah Blum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scientists Craig and Sharon Ramey have developed a neuroscience-based child care model that uses noise and communication to stimulate brain development in children; however, experts debate whether their approach is a beneficial supplement to parenting, especially for poor and neglected children.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dial-A-Wife</strong></td>
<td>675</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Margaret Talbot</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The author shadows Beth Berg, domestic expert for hire. By taking care of a host of domestic details that her clients are too busy to handle, Berg is in the business of selling time to the affluent.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Battle Over Child Care</strong></td>
<td>678</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Wilson Quarterly</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many politicians agree that there is a child care crisis in the United States, but should government get involved?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CASE 2: Nontraditional Family</strong></td>
<td>681</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>681</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anti-nuclear Reaction</strong></td>
<td>682</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Economist</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argues that nuclear family is a modern invention.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Is Love Colorblind?</strong></td>
<td>686</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Sailer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As recently as 30 years ago, interracial marriage was a crime, and the practice is still opposed by certain segments of the population. Sailer examines current public opinions about interracial marriage.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Overseas Adoptions: The Secret Everyone Is Talking About</strong></td>
<td>689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephanie Brill</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brill claims that same-sex couples who adopt children overseas are forced back into the closet.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A MODEL ANALYSIS OF FORMAL ARGUMENT</strong></td>
<td>693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susan Caba’s “She Loves Me, She Loves Me Not”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Credits</strong></td>
<td>697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Index</strong></td>
<td>703</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>